

# Juvenile growth post-settlement from experimental study of carryover effects of ocean acidification on larval and juvenile Olympia oysters; conducted at Bodega Marine Lab in July-Sept 2009

**Website:** <https://www.bco-dmo.org/dataset/658678>

**Data Type:** Other Field Results, experimental

**Version:** 13 Sept 2016

**Version Date:** 2016-09-13

## Project

» [Bodega Ocean Acidification Research](#) (BOAR)

Contributors	Affiliation	Role
<a href="#">Gaylord, Brian</a>	University of California - Davis: Bodega Marine Laboratory (UC Davis-BML)	Principal Investigator, Contact
<a href="#">Hill, Tessa M.</a>	University of California - Davis: Bodega Marine Laboratory (UC Davis-BML)	Co-Principal Investigator
<a href="#">Russell, Ann D.</a>	University of California-Davis (UC Davis)	Co-Principal Investigator
<a href="#">Sanford, Eric</a>	University of California - Davis: Bodega Marine Laboratory (UC Davis-BML)	Co-Principal Investigator
<a href="#">Rauch, Shannon</a>	Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution (WHOI BCO-DMO)	BCO-DMO Data Manager

## Table of Contents

- [Dataset Description](#)
  - [Methods & Sampling](#)
  - [Data Processing Description](#)
- [Data Files](#)
- [Parameters](#)
- [Instruments](#)
- [Deployments](#)
- [Project Information](#)
- [Funding](#)

## Dataset Description

Juvenile growth (on days 7 and 52 post-settlement) from experimental study of carryover effects of ocean acidification on larval and juvenile Olympia oysters. The study examined the consequences of decreased pH and carbonate saturation on the early life stages of Olympia oysters. Oysters were reared in three levels of seawater pH (8.0, 7.9, 7.8) and their growth rates were measured/compared.

Related datasets:

[juvenile growth - experiment 2](#)

[larval growth - experiment 1](#)

## Methods & Sampling

**Detailed methodology and results are described in following publication:**

Hettinger, A., E. Sanford, T.M. Hill, A.D. Russell, K.N. Sato, J. Hoey, M. Forsch, H.N. Page, and B. Gaylord. 2012. Persistent carry-over effects of planktonic exposure to ocean acidification in the Olympia oyster. *Ecology* 93:

### **Briefly (excerpted from above):**

Oysters were reared at Bodega Marine Laboratory (BML) in two experiments. These data are from experiment 1. In both, seawater CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in the treatment cultures were increased relative to present-day levels by 100 and 400 ppm. Thus, seawater CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations employed in the experiments were: 700 (used as an operational control), 800, and 1100 ppm. Such CO<sub>2</sub> levels correspond to pH values of approximately 8.0, 7.9, and 7.8 (NBS scale). These nominal pH levels were used subsequently to identify the treatments.

Oysters were reared from early larval life in 4.5-L glass culture jars held in seawater tables maintained at 20.0 (+/- 0.02) degrees C. All seawater used during rearing was filtered at 0.45 µm and pre-adjusted to appropriate pH levels in 20 L carboys by bubbling for 2-3 days with NIST-traceable CO<sub>2</sub> air mixtures (hereafter referred to as "carboy water"). Acrylic boxes mounted over each seawater table received the same mixed gases and provided a common head space for six jars, minimizing off-gassing during culturing. Levels of pH used for each box, and jar position within a box, were randomly assigned.

#### *Larval culturing:*

Adult Olympia oysters (4-7 cm in length) were collected from Tomales Bay and transported to BML. They were cleaned and distributed among multiple 100-L cylinders containing seawater filtered at 0.45 µm and held at 18-22 degrees C. At least one female per cylinder released larvae within 48 hours post-collection, enabling acquisition of independent "larval cohorts". Following release, larvae were transferred into culture jars containing 2L of seawater filtered at 0.45 µm (day 1 of the experiment). Every other day, 90% of the seawater in each jar was changed and replaced with carboy water, whose pH had stabilized to the appropriate level.

#### *Water chemistry:*

Samples of jar water and carboy water were collected every day. Seawater pH (NBS) and temperature were measured using a pH/temperature meter (Accumet Excel XL60; Thermo Fisher Scientific, Waltham, Massachusetts, USA), and salinity was determined using a YSI 6600V2 multiparameter instrument (YSI, Yellow Springs, Ohio, USA). Alkalinity was measured using automated Gran titration (Metrohm 809; Metrohm, Herisau, Switzerland), and standardized using certified reference material from A. Dickson at Scripps Institution of Oceanography. Other carbonate system parameters were calculated using the software, CO<sub>2</sub>SYS (Lewis and Wallace 1998).

#### *Sampling of larvae and juveniles:*

Oysters in the culture jars were sampled at key time points during each experiment to quantify shell size and growth rate (change in shell area per day). On day 1, 100 larvae per larval cohort were collected haphazardly by pipette, fixed in 95% ethanol, and individually photographed under a microscope (Leica DM1000 with DC290 camera; Leica Microsystems, Wetzlar, Germany) for analysis using ImageJ software (version 1.37) to determine the initial projected area of the shell (software available online). Larval shell growth rates at later time points were calculated similarly. Juvenile shell growth rate following settlement was determined by measuring the projected shell area of settled individuals from photographs, subtracting the area of the larval shell (which remains visually distinct), and dividing that value by the number of days postsettlement.

#### *Experiment 1:*

In the first experiment (July–September 2009), oyster larvae from four larval cohorts were reared in pH 8.0, 7.9, and 7.8 seawater through the duration of planktonic larval development, and for 52 days post-settlement. Each of three pH levels were replicated by two boxes, and all four larval cohorts were represented by one to two culture jars in each box (N = 36 jars total). Fifteen larvae were haphazardly sampled from each jar at day 9 and fixed in 95% ethanol for later photographing. Larvae were allowed to settle directly onto the bottoms of the jars. Larvae reached competency on approximately day 11, and by day 13, the majority of larvae had settled across all treatments. Seven days after settlement, the bottom of each jar was removed and juveniles attached to the jar bottoms were photographed (N = 20 per jar). The juveniles were then transferred to a flow-through seawater table maintained at 20 degrees C, where they received ambient food concentrations from Bodega Bay. After 45 days in this common garden environment (52 days after settlement), juveniles were again photographed to determine their size.

## **Data Processing Description**

### **BCO-DMO processing:**

- modified parameter names to conform with BCO-DMO naming conventions;
- replaced blanks (missing data) with "nd" ("no data").

[ [table of contents](#) | [back to top](#) ]

---

## Data Files

File
<b>juv_growth_exp1.csv</b> (Comma Separated Values (.csv), 50.70 KB) MD5:95bd802a2aa8e62747faabea99dc8c4d Primary data file for dataset ID 658678

[ [table of contents](#) | [back to top](#) ]

---

## Parameters

Parameter	Description	Units
day	Day post-settlement	unitless
experiment	Experiment number	unitless
pH_nominal	Nominal pH	pH units (NBS scale)
larval_cohort	Larval cohort identifier	unitless
jar	Jar identifier	unitless
rep	Replicate	unitless
larval_shell_area	Larval component of shell area, equivalent to size at settlement	square millimeters (mm <sup>2</sup> )
total_shell_area	Total shell area	square millimeters (mm <sup>2</sup> )
juvenile_growth	Juvenile growth	square millimeters (mm <sup>2</sup> )
juv_growth_rate	Juvenile growth rate	square millimeters per day (mm <sup>2</sup> /day)

[ [table of contents](#) | [back to top](#) ]

---

## Instruments

<b>Dataset-specific Instrument Name</b>	DC290
<b>Generic Instrument Name</b>	Camera
<b>Dataset-specific Description</b>	Individuals were examined under a microscope (Leica DM1000 with DC290 camera)
<b>Generic Instrument Description</b>	All types of photographic equipment including stills, video, film and digital systems.

<b>Dataset-specific Instrument Name</b>	Leica DM1000
<b>Generic Instrument Name</b>	Microscope - Optical
<b>Dataset-specific Description</b>	Individuals were examined under a microscope (Leica DM1000 with DC290 camera)
<b>Generic Instrument Description</b>	Instruments that generate enlarged images of samples using the phenomena of reflection and absorption of visible light. Includes conventional and inverted instruments. Also called a "light microscope".

<b>Dataset-specific Instrument Name</b>	YSI 6600V2
<b>Generic Instrument Name</b>	Multi Parameter Portable Meter
<b>Dataset-specific Description</b>	Salinity was determined using a YSI 6600V2 multi-parameter instrument (YSI, Yellow Springs, Ohio)
<b>Generic Instrument Description</b>	An analytical instrument that can measure multiple parameters, such as pH, EC, TDS, DO and temperature with one device and is portable or hand-held.

<b>Dataset-specific Instrument Name</b>	Accumet Excel XL60
<b>Generic Instrument Name</b>	pH Sensor
<b>Dataset-specific Description</b>	Seawater pH (NBS) and temperature were quantified using a pH/temperature meter: Accumet Excel XL60 (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Waltham, MA)
<b>Generic Instrument Description</b>	An instrument that measures the hydrogen ion activity in solutions. The overall concentration of hydrogen ions is inversely related to its pH. The pH scale ranges from 0 to 14 and indicates whether acidic (more H+) or basic (less H+).

<b>Dataset-specific Instrument Name</b>	Metrohm 809
<b>Generic Instrument Name</b>	Titrator
<b>Dataset-specific Description</b>	Alkalinity was measured using automated Gran titration (Metrohm 809; Metrohm, Herisau, Switzerland)
<b>Generic Instrument Description</b>	Titrators are instruments that incrementally add quantified aliquots of a reagent to a sample until the end-point of a chemical reaction is reached.

<b>Dataset-specific Instrument Name</b>	Accumet Excel XL60
<b>Generic Instrument Name</b>	Water Temperature Sensor
<b>Dataset-specific Description</b>	Seawater pH (NBS) and temperature were quantified using a pH/temperature meter: Accumet Excel XL60 (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Waltham, MA)
<b>Generic Instrument Description</b>	General term for an instrument that measures the temperature of the water with which it is in contact (thermometer).

[ [table of contents](#) | [back to top](#) ]

---

## Deployments

### BML\_Gaylord

<b>Website</b>	<a href="https://www.bco-dmo.org/deployment/658395">https://www.bco-dmo.org/deployment/658395</a>
<b>Platform</b>	lab Bodega Marine Laboratory
<b>Start Date</b>	2010-09-01
<b>End Date</b>	2011-06-30

[ [table of contents](#) | [back to top](#) ]

---

## Project Information

### Bodega Ocean Acidification Research (BOAR)

**Website:** <http://bml.ucdavis.edu/research/research-programs/climate-change/oceanacidification/>

**Coverage:** Central California coast (northeast Pacific)

The absorption of human-produced CO<sub>2</sub> into the world's oceans is decreasing seawater pH and causing marked declines in the saturation state for calcium carbonate, a major building block for shells, skeletons, and tests of many marine species. Such changes (collectively termed "ocean acidification") have the potential to devastate a broad array of organisms, both at the level of individuals and at population and ecosystem scales. Although awareness of these issues is rapidly growing, most of what is known is based on studies of coral reef organisms and plankton.

The proposed work will enhance understanding of impacts from ocean acidification by providing rigorous data on several new fronts applicable to temperate systems. The project will operate within one of the strongest upwelling centers of the eastern Pacific, where global trends in acidification are amplified by the presence of cold water characterized by already-high levels of aqueous CO<sub>2</sub>. Using an integrated, comparative approach that exploits the expertise of oceanographers, marine chemists, and biologists, the project will explicitly couple moored and shipboard measurements of seawater chemistry to controlled laboratory and field studies of biological responses.

Two vital foundation species (the California mussel, *Mytilus californianus*, and the Olympia oyster, *Ostrea conchaphila*) will be targeted. These two species play disproportionately important roles in open-coast and estuarine systems, respectively. Larvae (which are often the most vulnerable stages) of mussels and oysters will be cultured under elevated-CO<sub>2</sub> conditions through the full pelagic period and into juvenile life. Growth and survivorship will be quantified, and water temperature and salinity will be varied to test for interactive effects of multiple factors. Intraspecific variation in response of larvae from different parental lineages will be examined. "Carry-over" effects that originate from exposure during the larval stage, but influence subsequent juvenile growth and survival, will be determined both in the laboratory and using field outplants. Because larval and

juvenile stages play important roles as demographic age-structure bottlenecks, overall population consequences will be estimated through comparison of observed impacts on early life stages to other recognized sources of recruitment variation.

**Data Status:** Data will be reported from the BML offshore oceanographic moorings and from moorings within nearby Tomales Bay. The moorings will be outfitted with autonomously recording pH and pCO<sub>2</sub> sensors, and these measurements will be supplemented with discrete water samples collected monthly along two associated transects.

**Live Data:** For live-streaming data from Tomales Bay, visit <http://www.ipacoa.org/Explorer> and click on the icon in Tomales Bay.

[ [table of contents](#) | [back to top](#) ]

---

## Funding

Funding Source	Award
<a href="#">NSF Division of Ocean Sciences (NSF OCE)</a>	<a href="#">OCE-0927255</a>

[ [table of contents](#) | [back to top](#) ]